

# Female Politicians in Political Parties of 2014 Election: Descriptive Representation vs. Substantive Representation

**Nuri Soeseno**

Department of Political Science, Faculty of Social Science  
and Politics, University of Indonesia

[nsoeseno@yahoo.com](mailto:nsoeseno@yahoo.com)

---

## Abstract

Women's representation in parties and legislative institutions is closely related to Indonesian party typology as office seekers. It charted a descriptive mandate to fulfill 30% quote of women's representation in the General Election in 2014—not necessarily, representing women's critical agenda. The phenomena of female legislators who were celebrities, actresses, singers, or coming from political dynasties is the consequence of office seekers' parties. Women's representation in legislative does not then guarantee the promotion, empowerment, and protection of women's critical issues in societies, as the female legislators do not represent women substantively. It is now more important to support critical actors who understand women's issues to succeed a feminist agenda.

Keywords: female politician, political party, election, descriptive and substantive representation, critical actors.

---

## Introduction

Entering the third Election (2014) after the affirmative policy was ratified; the notion of women representation whether women would be able to become politicians, whether female legislative candidate was needed, or whether there was enough women who could be recruited as legislative candidates were no longer debated. The discussion of women representation in 2014 Election was filled with the rumors of female politicians' behavior who were in formal political organizations and women who were nominated by political parties to sit in the legislative council for the next five years. Discussion, talks, and information about women's political representation were filled with corrupted female politician phenomena, celebrities who were nominated as legislative candidates, or family members of political party elitists as the legislative candidate and the ones who were in the political party consulate. How was the reality of female politicians in Indonesia? How was woman's position in political party? How was their representation, their political manner, their position in political party? Were they 'self-made' or celebrities or from a dynasty (family, father, husband) of a certain political party or the ruling regime? The questions would remain: how was the actual representation of women and female politicians' behavior in formal political institutions such as parliaments and political parties.

In this paper the author would argue that the political party system emerged after the fall of the New Order (*Order Baru*) regime—which was not based on ideology and division in society—defined women's recruitment in political parties and as legislative candidates, the forms of representation, and political behavior of female politicians. An opinion says that the political party system was a reflection of the political situation and social condition in society. If the society was divided into groups, the political party system would also follow the dividing line of social, economical, cultural, religious, ideological and territorial groups as presented in the society. Political parties would represent or fight for the groups created through the existing division in society, like farmers, workers, merchants/businessmen, religious groups, socialists, liberalists, communists and so on. The following political parties would recruit trustworthy members and would be

able to represent the interest, values and norms, ideology or identity of the groups they represented. Likewise, the ideology, values, norms, political party identity or interest the party fought for would be the magnet for the society to become a member or voters to vote in the Election. Social, economic and political changes that occurred in society would bring a change in the political party system and, therefore, would influence the change which happened in member recruitment or party supporters<sup>1</sup>.

The overgrowing tendency in the implementation of the 30% quota of women representation worried many parties, including women activists, expert on politics, and the society at large. The lack of political party cadres forced them to recruit women from outside the party just to fill the quota. This mode of recruitment of the non-party members as legislative candidates was feared to have an impact on the quality of female politicians, particularly in the political arena and on democracy in general. The discussion on the quality of female politicians was related to the issue of political representation (whether the politicians and female legislative candidates voiced and represented the voters or constitution they represented or they were only a symbol of democracy) and the action of female politicians in the public position they had (the accountability issue: towards the constituent or towards the chairman of the political party who recruited them). Because of the lack of female cadres in political parties and the recruitment pattern of legislative candidates in the 2014 Election, it was feared that Drude Dahledurp's (1988) statement that "representation of marginal group shifts from token representation to influential representation when this critical mass has been achieved" (Shireen Hassim in Shapiro et al., 2009: 211) would not happen in the Indonesian political context.

### **Party as Office-Seekers & Non-Ideological: New Order Era**

The political party system decides how the candidates or legislative candidates are chosen and prepared for their political role. According to Alan Ware, the political party system underwent a change after the ideology-based parties (communists, socialists, Christian democrats, liberalist, etc.) had degraded<sup>2</sup>. According to Ware political scientists are still looking for an answer to the question what would happen to the

next political party system. Ware offered three types of political party categorization. They are: (1) Political parties change from representing conflicting groups in society into teams of politicians competing to acquire power for themselves and they mobilize the voters to obtain it. He called this party type a party of office-seekers. (2) New political parties and different structures with their own interests are formed as a response to the development of new divisions in society (new cleavages and new parties). (3) The existing division would decrease but it would not completely disappear, and most probably a new division line would appear. The existing parties would survive and the leaders would try to develop new divisions to defend their power. According to Ware, the difference between the third and the first type is that the third type has to operate in the context of interest and identity cleavages existing in society. The difference between the third and the second type is that political leaders in the third type have to be able to adapt in order to mobilize new identities<sup>3</sup>.

Political party system emerged after the fall of New Order regime seemed to be closely similar to the first typology: party as office-seekers. New Order's policy to deideologize politics and political party, which was held for more than three decades, was able to repress the difference and conflict based on the ideology and religion among the parties that strongly rooted from political party system since this country was established. And, the *depolitization* policy carried out by the New Order regime created a floating mass in political space; voters were no longer divided according to social-cultural, religion, or political ideologies during the New Order era. The power was centralized in the political party leaders or elitists, loyalty and support of the members of voters was directed toward the leaders, instead of the party or party's ideology. Democratization opened up possibilities for myriads of new political actors to easily enter the political arena. In the elitist and ideology-sterilized political space, the new political actors were able to easily jump from one political party to other more-beneficial parties. Through election, politicians competed for power seats for themselves, their family, or groups and the floating mass was easier to be mobilized and became supporters for the parties competing in the election. In the 'office seekers' party system political party tends

to grow to become, as quoted from Otto Kirchheimer (1966), 'catch all' party. Such development trend in political party was described as follow:

Parties were no longer connected to loyal electorates through appeals based on ideology made primarily through organizations associated with the party. Instead, parties were now utilizing different methods of reaching voters and were considerably widening their target. They were now looking to attract voters by whatever means they could and from whatever social groups they could; this is the sense in which they were 'catch all'.<sup>4</sup>

Ideology-based politics was replaced by issue-based politics (especially politics related to identity). In the past, ideology determined the election strategy appointed by the party. The recruitment of party members and mobilization of voters were done on purpose. The political cadre system of the political leaders and legislative candidates was one of the most important party tasks<sup>5</sup>. The regeneration of leadership and the selection of office holders in political party are done institutionally and the party cadres were the only source of this recruitment of leaders and office holders. However, this system belongs to the past.

The increasing role of 'catch all parties' could be caused by two things. First, rapid political issue changes from time to time as the consequence of socio-economy-politic changes in the society was triggered by globalization and democratization. Parties had to be able to make a proper and fast response to the rapidly growing issue. Therefore, political parties had to be able to present 'a fresh image' to attract more potential groups, which were able to give support or recruit them as members. Party programs were designed to give solutions to urgent (or concerning) problems or issues that existed in society. If the party failed to do so, political activists would send criticisms toward the party leader, leave the party, or criticize them and leave<sup>6</sup>. Second, since the voters were no longer ideologically divided, political parties had to attenuate their ideology in order to attract as many voters with different background as possible<sup>7</sup>. In this kind of politics, according to Ware, the power would be held by the party or

the party leader who was able to exploit the development of modern communication and information technology and other relevant media to attract more supporters or new party members<sup>8</sup>. 'Catch all' party model was the most appropriate model for position/power-oriented political party system due to simple reason: political party elitists who run for position needed to catch as many votes as possible to win the election and get their position (power).

### **Who were Female Legislative Candidates in 2014 Election: Businesswomen, Celebrities, Activists?**

In the first election (1999) after the fall of New Order regime, female representation in DPR only reached 9%, while it was more than 10% in the New Order regime<sup>9</sup>. Organizational intervention should be done through affirmative action policy to raise the number and role of women formally in DPR. This opportunity was used by female activists amongst the civilians and political parties to build a movement, which insisted on the insertion of a 30% quota of female representation in the being-designed Law on General Election for the 2004 Election. The affirmative action policy of a 30% quota was included in Law No. 31 of 2002 on political parties and in Law No. 12 of 2003 on Election and it was immediately applied in the 2004 Election. The result was not significant, female representation in the People's Representative Council (DPR) increased 2%, from 9% (in the 1999 election) to 11% -- 61 out of 550 DPR members.

Affirmative policy became an important mechanism to fight for equal representation for women. Since the 2004 Election, the Law on elections and political parties had undergone two changes. In two revisions affirmative policy became firmer and the enforcement became stricter. Approaching the 2009 election, the government issued Law No. 2 of 2008 on political parties and Law No. 10 of 2008 on elections. In both laws, it was clearly stated that political parties had to include a minimum 30% quota of female candidates in organizational structures. Election Law No. 10 of 2008 Article 55 even stated that a modified zipper model was adopted in the candidate list; it means there had to be one female legislative candidate for every three candidates<sup>10</sup>. Affirmative policy refinement showed its result. In the 2009 election,

female representation in Central DPR rose about 7% when compared to the 2004 Election, becoming 18.04% (about 100 out of 560 DPR members were women).

Welcoming the 2014 Election, there was another revision of Law No. 8 of 2012 on general elections and Law No. 2 of 2011 on political parties. The requirement of a 30% quota in political party organizational structures was included in Article 15(d), and a 30% quota of female legislative candidates for DPR/D in Article 55. The requirement of the zipper model, which ensured the existence of female legislative candidate every three candidates, was emphasized in Article 56, section 2. This affirmative policy was later accentuated in its practice by the issue of Rule No. 7 of 2013 Article 27, Section 2(b) by General Election Commission (KPU), which employed penalties for political parties that failed to fulfill the requirement of a 30% quota of female legislative candidates. According to KPU's rule, if the quota was not met, the political party would lose its rights to compete in the related electoral constituency. Accordingly the affirmative policy through a 30% quota was expected to bring a better result in the 2014 Election.

Political parties' readiness to employ affirmative policy of 30% varied. Big political parties claimed that they were ready and had no problem of fulfilling the requirement of 30% female members both in organizational structures and among legislative candidates. Suryadharma Ali, the chairman of PPP, stated that his party had fulfilled the quota both in the central and regional level, and he thought that some regions had reached 48%. Other political parties also expressed their willingness to fulfill the requirement; they were Demokrat, PDIP, and Golkar. The General Chairman of Partai Demokrat, who at that time was Anad Urbaningrum, ensured that his party had achieved the female representation quota in order to join 2014 Election. Puan Maharani, daughter of the Chairman of PDIP Megawati Sukarno Putri, PDIP, stated that she would have to recheck her party's readiness and would try to fulfill the requirement on the regional and provincial level. Meanwhile, the Vice General Secretary of Golkar, Nurul Arifin, stated that for his party, the requirement was an easy to meet and fulfill. For some small political parties and the new ones that participated in this year's election, the requirement of the 30% quota could pose a problem

if it was employed consistently. The General Secretary of Hanura, Saleh Husin said that *"Berat kalau di semua tingkatan, nggak gampang di kabupaten. [Karena] di daerah kebanyakan ibu rumah tangga dan mereka tidak mau. Kalau itu dipaksakan tentunya partai akan menaruh istri, adik dan keluarganya untuk syarat di daerah"* – it is difficult if we have to apply this rule in all levels of administration, it is difficult in the Kabupaten. [Because] there are only housewives [there] and they are not interested. If the rule is enforced parties will have to recruit candidates from among family members such as wives or sisters at the district level<sup>11</sup>.

If the politics, which was dominated by "catch all" or "office seekers" political parties, would be intervened with the affirmative policy of a 30% quota for women, it was predicted that women who would be recruited by the parties would be party members or chosen as legislative candidates. Women who would enter the legislative candidate list, especially in the party, had the potency of becoming magnets for voters<sup>12</sup>. Since cadres were no longer important for "catch all" and "office seekers" parties, then it was predicted that most of the women who would join a party or be chosen as legislative candidates were not from the political party cadre group. Women who were recruited to fulfill the quota could support or strengthen and would not threaten the position of the political party leaders (or elitists) who tried to earn their position (power) through elections. Women who were included in this category were the ones predicted to be considered by the party to be included in the legislative candidate pool in the 2014 Election.

The representation of the female legislative candidate was considered satisfying if it was calculated statistically from the permanent list of legislative candidates. In the *Daftar Calon Tetap (DCT)* or the permanent list of legislative candidates on the national level (DPR) the magical number of 30% was surpassed. Table 1 showed that the number of women in the candidate list reached 37.3% from the total. This percentage exceeded the quota required by the law. With this percentage, political parties succeeded on achieving the target. With this achievement it can be said that that descriptive female representation was acquired. However, if we study the female legislative candidates' background in DCT, we can see that the expectation of achieving a substantial female



representation was not met. The percentage of non-cadre candidates in the permanent list of legislative candidates is too high. Table 1 below shows this worrying numbers.

**Table 1**  
**Gender and Place of Origin of Legislative Candidates in 2014 Election**

No		Cadre	Non-Cadre	Total
1	Male	-	-	4142 (62.7%)
2	Female	747 (30.3%)	1718 (69,7%)	2465 (37.3%)
	Total			6608 (100%)

Source: taken from various sources, including Formappi

Data collection done by Formappi<sup>13</sup> showed that only 30.3% of female legislative candidates were political parties' cadres. This meant, almost 70% of female candidates listed in the pool nominated by the parties were non-party members; they were not cadres. The thirty percent quota of female representation as required by the Law of Election and Political Party had forced the parties to recruit mostly non-member female legislative candidates. This meant there were only 747 female cadres out of 2465 female legislative candidates; the rest (1718 persons) were non-cadre. They were recruited and nominated as legislative candidates just because they were women; this was the essence of identity politics. No wonder if there was a term attached to such legislative candidate such as *caleg cabutan* or *caleg tidur- unselected or sleeping candidates*<sup>14</sup>.

Who were actually the female legislative candidates recruited by the political parties in the 2014 Election? By describing the occupational background of the candidates, faint descriptions of female legislative candidates would appear. Out of the female candidates' occupation listed in the legislative candidate list, the description of the 2014 female legislative candidates was as follows:

**Table 2****Occupational Background of Female Legislative Candidates**

No	Occupation Group <sup>15</sup>	N	% <sup>16</sup>
1	Businessman/Private	1032	41,9
2	Special Profession (Doctor, Advocate, Religionist, Academician, Celebrity)	512	20,8
3	Civil Servant Retirements (BUMN, DPR/DPD/DPRD Staffs, Ministry/Authorities/President Staff, Civil Servant, Retiree)	202	8,2
4	Politician (member/former member DPR/DPD/DPRD)	177	7,2
5	Activist (journalist, LSM, University Student)	81	3,3
6	Authorities (minister, chief area, former chief area/ minister)	9/10	0,4
7	Others (housewives, unpublished occupation, no explanation)	451	18,3
	Total	2465	100

Source: KPU documents on DCT for 2014 Election and were processed by Formappi

It is interesting to compare the data on the table with the discussion and debate on female legislative candidates in the mass media and social media. The heated discussion in the social and mass medias mostly concentrated on celebrity legislative candidates (movie actresses, models, singers, TV show actresses), who were statistically only a small portion of all female legislative candidates. The table above shows that there are 51 celebrities from the entertainment world who are registered in the permanent list of legislative candidates: 21 women (41%) and 30 men (59%). Actually this 21 celebrity female candidates was only 0.85% out of the total number of all female legislative candidates. This number was incomparable to the notion of celebrity legislative candidates, which seemed to be exaggerated. While the mass and social media were busy talking about these 21 celebrity female legislative candidates, 1032 women (41.9% of all female candidates) who had professional occupations as businesswoman and ran private enterprises were ignored from public scrutiny<sup>17</sup>.

Celebrity legislative candidates served as magnets to attract (invite) more voters or as vote getters for their political parties. Discussions

on celebrity legislative candidates have become popular in recent years of female representation. For small or new political parties, the presence of these celebrities as legislative candidates gave significant contributions in the competition of getting more exposure in mass media. This was admitted by one of 2014 Election participants, even though the news was negative. When he was asked about controversies over the background (like swimsuit models and second-class actresses and actors) of celebrity legislative candidates' nominated by PPP, the Chairman of the Campaign Division of PPP stated that this was beneficial for the party, as the party had struggled for media attention over the last two years. He explained that the recruitment of celebrity legislative candidates was a part of a strategy to attract public and media attention.

To launch celebrities as legislative candidates was not coincidental; it was a trend in contemporary politics. Some political scientists made an interesting point to explain this phenomenon. John Street, for example, saw the presence of celebrities as politicians as positive. However, he questioned the possibility of the celebrities to use their reputation to "*...reinvigorate politics with new ideas and an aggregated form of political agency.*" Because he thought, political studies needed to study how performance was constructed and character was articulated, since they built a transaction between the representing and the represented in democracy. Significant political relationships, according to Street—as cited by Mark Wheeler (2013)—constructed as a show/performance<sup>18</sup>. Meanwhile, the agency form of these celebrities was shown through their ability to interact with public, to be able to touch the public's sentiment<sup>19</sup>. Cited Thompson (1995) and Holmes (2005), Wheeler saw that celebrities from the entertainment world had the ability to build more intimate relationships with people who were remote from them through fans' networking. He considered this as a basic form of political representation<sup>20</sup>.

That fact that most political parties competing in national elections had celebrity legislative candidates should be the main attention when discussing celebrity as legislative candidate. The data acquired from the permanent list of legislative candidates (DCT) showed that 9 of 12 (or 75%) of the political parties participated in the 2014 election on the

national level had celebrities<sup>21</sup>. That 75% of the election participants recruited celebrities as legislative candidates should be a phenomenon worthy of attention. Contagion theory could be used to explain this recruitment phenomenon by political parties<sup>22</sup>. Contagion theory was developed to explain the increasing number of female representation in political parties. The theory explained that the contagion began when a party worked as the catalyst, which promoted female legislative candidates. This party's actions forced other parties to do the same since they feared losing voters if they did not do so. The phenomenon of celebrity legislative candidates could be seen through a contagion theory perspective. In the earlier elections after the fall of the New Order regime, the presence of celebrity legislative candidates was very limited. Golkar had a few; they were usually employed during election campaign. PDIP as an opposition party to the New Order regime was also supported by and had some celebrity politicians among their party cadre members. In the 2014 Election, 9 out of 12 (75%) election participants promoted celebrities as legislative candidates.

How were female legislative candidates recruited? According to R. Matland and K. Montgomery, there were three phases (and obstacles) that should be passed by women before they were selected as legislative members: first: they had to choose themselves; second, they had to go through the selection process done by the political party to become legislative candidates; third, they were chosen by the constituents to become legislative members. In the recruitment process, a legislative candidate should understand the factors of the recruitment structures (norms and party's rules) as well as the recruitment environment (economic development level, culture, and selection system), and it would be significant. Political parties played a role as gatekeepers which chose some qualified women who could be nominated as legislative candidates. The phase where the party chose legislative candidates was the most crucial phase for women to earn political status<sup>23</sup>.

Political party's role as a gatekeeper was significant as women nominated by the parties as legislative candidates should have adequate political capacity and capability. The party was responsible to recruit and prepare them to do their job and their political role in representative council or government. Becoming political party

administrators was one of the most important training goals for the candidates before they could hold political positions in legislative institution or in bureaucracy. Party administrators were challenged to be able to articulate and aggregate constituents' interest, to arrange political party agendas, to be involved in debates and discussions or to make cooperation with factions in the party or with other parties, to make decisions and implement a taken decision or policy. These abilities were part of four logical phase of collective and democratic decision making<sup>24</sup>.

### **Female Politician from Political Dynasty**

Celebrity legislative candidates were not the only phenomenon of legislative candidate recruitment that voters were concerned about. Another phenomenon, which received much criticism, related to the recruitment of legislative candidates who had familial relationship with political party leaders or elitists (both on the central and regional levels). In an "office seeker"-oriented party system, centralization of power on party leaders or elitist and patron culture was strong, thus, the practice of family member recruitment was considered easy to do and uncontrollable. The presence of 15 legislative candidates (5 women) who were the family members of S. B. Yudhoyono – the party leader of Demokrat until 2010 and right now was the Chairman of Supervisory Board of the party – was one concrete example of dynasty politics practice. The data regarding this practice (dynasty politics) could be found in the news, which showed that 16 out of 44 legislative candidates (36%)<sup>25</sup> who had familial relationships with party leaders of elitists were women. Further studies on this phenomenon would be able to reveal how the percentage was for women recruited to be legislative candidates based on their familial relationship with the leaders or elitists. The percentage of the dynasty politics phenomenon was very influential in the Parliament of India. About 28.6% (or three out of ten) of the parliament members owed their seats to familial relationships and 69.5% of female parliament members entered the parliament for their family<sup>26</sup>. Besides the negative impact it triggered such as corruption or hindering fair competition in elections, the practice of dynasty politics damaged the trust of the selected women as legislative members and

discredited the policy of affirmative policy for women. Dynasty politics should not be allowed to grow.

In public discussions regarding female legislative candidates, moral issues received more attention compared to women's agency. News or discussions on politicians or legislative candidates were filled with moral issues, while the political ability of the candidates in formal political organizations were often ignored and not included in public discussions. News and public debates on women politicians were dominated by corruption cases and controversies concerning female celebrities as legislative candidates. Negative behavior of the female politicians (such as corruption or wearing branded things) as public authorities and female legislative candidates (as male magazine models or second-class actress) became the main topic of public discussions.

Public discussions on female politicians' negative behavior in mass media and social media were parallel to the findings done by Prapanca Research Center. According to the report, women became the main discussion topic in politics when they were scandal objects. In the observation of discussions in the social media, which was done over a period of six months (1/27-6/27, 2013), there was no mention of women who had a strong image. Male politicians who were observed through social media such as Twitter, for example Jokowi, Jusuf Kalla, or Mahfud MD, were remembered by the public as figures who had a strong character, who had the opportunity of bringing a change, and they were idealized as Indonesia's leaders. These characters qualities were invisible in female figures. Meanwhile, the discussion on Megawati, the leader of PDIP since New Order and the woman who became the fifth President of Indonesia, was full of jokes about her, while the good qualities of her leadership were never mentioned.<sup>27</sup>

Indeed, there were female politicians who had their own opinion, had the capacity to act, and were able to make intelligent choices and good decisions/policy in formal political organizations. One of the most popular as a figure for her capacity was Sri Mulyani Indrawati, who formerly worked as the Minister of Finance during S.B. Yudhoyono's governance. Unfortunately, female politicians' ability in politics was not much of a topic in mass media. Actions and achievements of female politicians were not discussed in the public space, unlike male

politicians'. A study which compared media coverage given to the able male and female politicians, agreed to this point. The report written about the findings of this study stated that media coverage on female politicians (Megawati, Rieke D. Pitaloka, Puan Maharani, Yenny Wahid, and Nurul Arifin) in social media was incomparable to one male politician (Dahlan Iskan); the total number of media coverage received by all female politicians mentioned above was only 532000 discussion, and the number of media coverage for Dahlan Iskan reached 592000<sup>28</sup>.

The lack of women who have the capacity in politics remains the main reason for the difficulty in legislative candidate recruitment by political parties. A journalistic report that appeared in *Indosiar.com* entitled *Kuota 30 Persen Perempuan dalam Politik* was a reflection of the thought. As explained in the report "... hingga sekarang banyak partai politik yang masih kesulitan menjaring calon legislatif (caleg) perempuan, terutama yang memiliki kapabilitas yang memadai" – there were still some political parties which had difficulties in recruiting female legislative candidates, especially those with adequate capability<sup>29</sup>. Many strategies were designed and various programs were employed as a response to the conclusion of the 2004 Election. Female activists and politics observers looked for a breakthrough to solve this problem. Programs of political education for women were planned and carried out and a pool of quality women who could be nominated as candidates was listed. Political Studies Center, FISIP of Indonesia University, made a list of women who could be recruited by political parties to join a party or become legislative candidates. Programs of political education for female legislative candidates, which should be carried out by political parties, were held by various Civil Society Organization or Research Centers<sup>30</sup>.

### **Obstacles Faced by Women in Political Party Organizational Structures**

How was women's active agency interpreted in the recruitment process of female legislative candidates for the 2014 Election? Women's active agency in the 2014 legislative candidates seemed to be defined through their educational level. Legislative candidate lists issued by KPU showed that 75.8% or more than two-third of female legislative

candidates were university educated (either undergraduates, graduates and postgraduates). The data showed that most female legislative candidates in the 2014 Election were highly educated. The tendency of high education could also be seen among the 2009-2014 DPR RI members. Statistically issued by KPU Media Center, 46.8% members were Bachelor's Degree graduates, 34.61% held Master's Degree, and 8.01% held Doctoral Degree. Moreover, some of them also held Diploma 3 Degree, thus making 91.61% of 2009-2014 DPR RI members held high education. They were only 5.46% of legislative members in that period who were high school graduates<sup>31</sup>. Education factor seemed to be one of the most important factors to join politics. It was possible that, statistically, the number of highly-educated legislative members were greater than the ones who had experience in politics as political party cadre? Did education become a ticket to enter formal political organization? Could formal education replace practice experience as a cadre or political party member? Even though education was important for people, including legislative members, the author thought that education could not replace the practice of political education—through involvement and direct participation in political activities and organizations—and political cadre for legislative candidates and politicians who would devote their life for politics.

Political agency could be acquired and trained through direct involvement and participation in political activities and organizations. Cadres and prospective members for political party could acquire experience through following the activities, involved in and participated in *underbow* organizations, youth party organizations, or other organizations that supported or held the same ideology to political parties. For legislative candidates who were party cadres, getting involved in organizational structures gave them invaluable experience in political praxis. Unfortunately such an experience was not acquired by female legislative candidates in the 2014 Election. If seen through organizational structures of 73 parties in KPU's preliminary list for the 2014 Election, there was a minimum opportunity for women to fill important positions in the organization (chairman, general secretary, and treasurer) among the 73 parties in KPU's preliminary list for the 2014 Election.



**Table 3**  
**Organizational Structure based on Gender**

	Position	Male		Female	
		(1)	(2)	(1)	(2)
1	Chairman	63(86.3%)	11 (91.7%)	10 (13.7%)	1(8,3%)
2	Treasurer	47(64.4%)	10 (83.3%)	26 (35.6%)	2(16,7%)
3	General Secretary	70 (96%)	12 (100%)	3 (4%)	0 (0%)
	Total	180 (82%)	33 (88.9%)	39 (18%)	3 (11,1%)

Source: taken from data accessible from KPU media center and mass media in 2014.

Notes: (1) political parties listed in KPU; (2) political parties passed verification 11.

The data above shows that there still was a lack of women who held positions in political parties’ organizational structures. There were only 18% women who did. And from the top three most important positions in the parties, most women posed as general treasurer (35%). The position as general secretary was not held often by women (4%). On the other hand, 13.7% of the political parties listed in KPU were led by women. Unfortunately, only one (out of 12) party passed the KPU verification test to join the 2014 Election. Only one out of the 12 parties that passed the verification test was led by woman. As seen through the organizational structure above, there were only three women (1 chair and 2 treasurers) out of 36 persons who were in the three top positions in the 12 parties which contested in the 2014 Election.

The 30% quota requirement of women in political parties’ organizational structure for the 2014 Election was creatively handled by the parties. Important positions in the party’s management were still held by men. Women were usually placed as vice chairs or members (under the general secretary or treasurer). For example, in the Hanura party there were 10 Vice General Secretaries (seven men, three women) and 10 treasurers (four men, six women); the PPP had one woman out of 2 Vice Treasurers. The PDIP was a different case. Megawati’s presence as the party leader was an exception<sup>32</sup>. In fact, the political party tradition in Indonesia was not ready for the presence

of women leaders. PDIP was not different from other political parties. Under Megawati's leadership, the general secretary and its vice secretaries, treasurer and its vice treasurers were all men; in the PDIP organizational structure, there were approximately 19 divisions that were led by three women and 16 men.

Besides chairman, general secretary, and general treasurer, there are other important positions in organizational structure of a political party. These positions are included in various councils within a party such as honorary council, advisory council, board of experts, supervisory council, *tanfidz* or *syuro* council. There is a saying that besides the General Chairman, the real authority of a political party lies with the chairman or the members of the above mentioned councils. Even though there are women in the councils, they are still dominated by men.

Where are the women in the organizational structure of a political party? In order to achieve the 30% quota, some women are placed in divisions, departments which people seldom heard about. Political party structures could expand due to the existence of these divisions/ departments/fields and these were where women were allowed to participate. This is the way women are included in organizational structures. Unfortunately there are no positions where they could improve their political ability or participate in making the political agenda of a party.

Based on a study on women leadership in Asia, Mary Katzenstein explains that there are two main factors that hinder the recruitment of women leadership: the social condition and the political organization. The social conditions that she observed among others are the class structure and the religious and cultural life. Factors on political organization that she observed among others are succession procedures and the party's stance towards women leadership. If both factors are analysed, it could be said that the political organization factor plays an important role in the presence of woman leadership in today's formal organizations. Social conditions are no longer the main hindrance. This could be seen through, for example, people's opinion on women's representation in politics and in political organizations. According to a survey conducted by the UNDP, 75% of the respondents accepted the

gender quota in politics and government, and 55% of the respondents stated that they would accept more women to be included in policy-making departments in the government<sup>33</sup>. Reading through the study done by the UNDP, we could say that people accepted women's political participation. Unfortunately, the political parties listed for the 2014 Election did not seem to share the voters' thoughts/ideas. Political parties did not yet seem to be ready to open a bigger chance for women to have important and decision making positions in organizational structures of a political party.

Political representation has been studied and researched by political scientists. Michael Saward is one of them. According to Saward, representation is constructed. The consequence of such an idea is there are political actors who make this construction –who create representation. One of the actors is political party<sup>34</sup>. These representatives represented the constituency, a group, themselves, an interest, a geographic area, and so on. In practice, these representatives could be the delegation or a trustee. As delegations, representatives followed the wish of the ones they represented, not according to what they wanted. As trustees, representatives only posed as the wish/interest bringer of the ones they represented. The power in this concept of representation as a delegation is in the hands of the constituents, the representatives will act according to the instructions they receive. As trustees, representatives would act according to what they thought best for the ones they represented. Representatives who were trustees could use their own thought, logic, and opinion to decide on the best action for their constituents, even though their decisions were not according to their constituents' wishes<sup>35</sup>. Based on both concepts, we could see the role played by political representatives when they do their tasks in political organization. Or, by observing the representatives' acts in organizations –political organizations –we could evaluate whether a representative acts as a delegation or as a trustee. How representatives play their role and who give the authority to play that role is an important matter that should be brought up in political discussions or debates.

## **Women Representation: Descriptive versus Substantive**

Representation could be defined in many ways. Hanna Pitkin, a political theorist, offers four different concepts of representation: formal, symbolic, descriptive, and substantive. Formal representation is representation formed as a result of institutional rules. Two important dimensions in formal representation are authorization and accountability. Symbolic representation is a concept on how the representative 'stands for' the represented. A person becomes the symbol representing or presenting something which is actually non-existent (not present), for example the flag or the king who represents the Nation. Descriptive representation is a form of representation based on similarity or resemblance between the representative and the ones he acts for (constituents/voters). In this form, the representative resembles those being represented. The representatives and the represented look alike or they share common interests or experiences. In substantive representation acts taken by the representatives are on behalf of or in the interest of the represented<sup>36</sup>.

How is female representation in politics if it is seen through the 30% of women representation in political parties and in legislative candidate lists for the 2014 Election? We could estimate the type of women's representation that will come out as a result of the affirmative action policy of the 30% quota in the 2014 Election by employing data processed<sup>37</sup> from legislative candidate lists and data on political parties collected by the KPU and other sources. First, women representation is descriptive as a consequence of the quota system, how female legislative candidates were recruited, and women position in the party organizational structure. Second, if the affirmative action policy has positive results and the 30% quota of female representation in the parliament is achieved, there is a hope that descriptive representation could bring substantive female representation in politics. Substantive representation means that legislative members will be able to voice and include more women-related issues: issues related to children, health, education, social/society welfare, and environment. Furthermore, a significant number of women in legislative institutions could raise the possibility of the ratification for more laws regarding women issues<sup>38</sup>.

Many female activists, feminists, and political theorists were

concerned that substantive representation could be realized through descriptive representation. Some studies show that descriptive representation (standing for) cannot guarantee the realization of substantive representation (acting for)<sup>39</sup>. The existing political party system and the ways female legislative candidates are recruited results in the forming of descriptive representation. The substantive representation will therefore not be achieved. This means (if the 30% quota is fulfilled) the presence of the 168 female legislative members of the 2014 Election in DPR does not warrant that the women's voice will be heard and their interests will be represented in the DPR. If descriptive representation merely has arisen from affirmative action policy, Richard Matland states that the quota "... has become a ceiling rather than a floor for further growth of women's political power"<sup>40</sup>.

The emergence of descriptive representation, which was not followed with substantial representation by applying affirmative action policy through quota system, has been studied by some political scholars. Sarah Childs and Mona Lena Krook in their paper entitled *Analyzing Women's Substantive Representation: From Critical Mass to Critical Actors* look at some studies on the influence of women's representation on women. According to Childs and Krook most of the literature on women representation tried to answer two main questions: "does women's presence in politics bring a change?" and "do women act for women?" The conclusion is indecisive. Some studies suggested that women's presence brought a change in discussions, debates, proposals, rules, regulations or policies. However, there were some studies that did not see any change in style and manner of female and male politicians. In order to bring a change, some women in legislative organizations were needed. It was assumed that more women in the organizations meant they would be able to build strategic coalition to promote laws or policies on women issue. Thirty percent of the total number of members was considered as "critical mass"<sup>41</sup>.

After studying the relation between women's descriptive and substantive representation in legislative institution, Childs and Krook thought that the critical mass approach should not be used. They suggested to change the focus of the approach in studying women's representation. They suggested: (1) not to focus on "if/when" women brought a change, but on "how" women's substantive representative

could be achieved; and (2) not to focus on what “women” did, but what some “critical actors”, the term commonly used by Childs and Krook, did. The first focus explained the issue of “acting for,” rather than merely “standing for.” The second focus raised the issue of “critical actors,” i.e. people who acted both individually and collectively to produce women-friendly policy<sup>42</sup>. These critical actors would also be the ones who drove the change of women representation from descriptive to substantive. However, according to Childs and Krook, even though “critical actors” tended to be women, it was also possible for men to be “critical actors”<sup>43</sup>.

It was important to identify these critical actors in order to explain the emergence of substantive female representation in policy-making institutions. According to Childs and Krook, the main characteristics of these critical actors were “... their relatively low threshold for political action: they may hold attitudes similar to those of other representatives, but they are much more motivated than others to initiate women-friendly policy reforms”<sup>44</sup>.

Even though Childs and Krook suggested a shift in approach on critical actors, they still admitted that the concept of critical mass was needed in order to study female legislative members’ actions. Critical actors carried important roles for mobilizing legislative members who were categorized as a “critical mass” in order to support women-friendly policy reforms<sup>45</sup>. In other words, substantive female representation could develop among groups representing descriptive representation due to the active role of the critical actors. Therefore, when studying female representation it is important to see how this substantive representation could happen. This means we have to pay more attention to what the critical actors do rather than of what the female legislative members do.

## **Conclusions**

Women representation in political institutions is expected to influence leadership and policymaking style. Beth Reingold studied different norms and approaches in decision making and leadership style between men and women. In the literature that Reingold used it was shown that the dominant approaches to policymaking and

leadership were often described in masculine terms i.g. formal, hierarchical and authoritative relationships; zero sum and win-lose competitions and conflicts; interpersonal dynamics such as coercion, control, dominance, and manipulation. Women's approaches to policymaking and leadership are different. According to Reingold women emphasized empowering, egalitarian, mutually beneficial and reciprocal relationships; compromise, consensus-building, and cooperation; and interpersonal skills such as honesty, openness, mutual respect and personal/moral integrity. Various research strengthen these findings, and women, according to Reingold, "... act on a broader, more inclusive, community oriented basis"<sup>46</sup>.

Many speculations could be made on female representation as the result of the 2014 Election. The discourse on female politicians and legislative candidates in the 2014 Election was filled with anxiety and pessimism: the 2014 Election would merely produce descriptive representation. If descriptive representation is a reality in politics, whether it is in political parties or in legislative institutions, there is little hope that women friendly policies and discourses on women's issues/ interests will be brought up in parliament. However, if there were some critical actors among critical mass of politicians and legislative members elected in 2014 Election, there were still hopes for a change. The identification and empowerment of individuals and groups of critical actors both in political party and legislative institutions, therefore, become strategic after the 2014 Election.

## References

- Brito, Monica and David Runciman (2008). *Representation*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Celis, Karen dan Sarah Childs, menuliskan dalam "Introduction: The Descriptive and Substantive Representation of Women: New Direction" in *Parliamentary Affairs* Vol.61, Issue 3: 419-425.
- Childs, Sarah and Mona Lena Krook (2009). "Analysing Women's Substantive Representation: From Critical Mass to Critical Actors" in *Government and Opposition*, Vol.44, No.2: 125-145.
- Cindy Herlin Mara, analis lembaga penelitian Prapanca Research dalam pemberitaan yang berjudul 'Citra Politisi Perempuan Indonesia Cenderung Buruk' in *Tribunenews.com*. 28 Juli 2013 (17.10 WIB). (diakses 04/03/2014)
- Fleschenberg, Andrea, "Asia's Women Politicians at the Top: Roaring Tigresses or Time Kittens?" dalam Iwanaga, bab 2, hal 1. Iwanaga-2\_extract.pdf (diakses 10/03/2014).

- Hassim, Shireen (2009). 'Perverse Consequences? The Impact of Quotas for Women on Democratization in Africa. Dalam Shapiro, Ian. Susan C. Stokes, Elisabeth Jean Wood, Alexander S. Kirshner (eds). (2009) *Political Representation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 221-235.
- Hylland, J.L. (1995), *Democratic Theory*, Manchester University Press, Michael Saward (1998) , *The Terms of Democrac*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Kenny, Meryl & Tania Verge (2013) *Contagion Theory Revisited: When do political parties compete on women's representation?*, paper yang akan dipresentasikan dalam Congreso AECPA, di Sevilla GT 2.8 Genero y politica en tiempos de cambio, 18-20 September.
- Laporan UNDP (2010) mengenai partisipasi perempuan dalam politik dan pemerintahan. partpol\_womenparticipationpoliticsgovernmentindonesia\_undp\_may2010.pdf (being accessed 12/03/2014)
- Leya Cattleya, Review: The Asia's Foundation's "Increasing Women's Political Participation and Strengthening Good Governance in Indonesia" Program Funded by the Royal Norwegian Embassy, Jakarta. Final Report. 2010. TAF's Program of Increasing Women Political Participation. (being accessed 02/03/2014)
- Puskapol. Kebijakan Peningkatan Keterwakilan Perempuan Pemilu 2004 dan 2009, [www.puskapol.ui.ac.id/artikel/kebijakan-peningkatan-keterwakilan-perempuan-pemilu-2004-dan-2009.html](http://www.puskapol.ui.ac.id/artikel/kebijakan-peningkatan-keterwakilan-perempuan-pemilu-2004-dan-2009.html)
- Reingold, Beth (2006) "Women as Office Holder: Linking Descriptive and Substantive Representation" paper prepared for for presentation at the conference on "Political Women and American Democracy" at University of Notre Dame, May 25-27, 2006: 5-10. (being accessed 08/03/2014)
- Richard Matland and K. Montgomery (2003) 'Recruiting Women to National Lagislature', in Julie Ballington & Richard Matland (2004) *Political Parties and Special Measures: Enhancing Women's Participation in Electoral Processes*.
- Saward, Michael (2010), *The Representative Claim*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Shapiro, Ian. Stokes, Susan C. Wood, Elisabeth Jean. Kirshner, Alexander S. (eds). *Political Representation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Soeseno, Nuri (2013). *Representasi Politik: Perkembangan dari Ajektiva ke Teori*. Depok: Puskapol.
- Statistik Anggota DPR 2009-2014 Hasil Pemilu Legislatif Berdasarkan Tingkat Pendidikan. [mediacenter.kpu.go.id/images/mediacenter/DATA\\_OLAHAN/juli/statistik\\_dpr\\_09-14-tingkat\\_pendidikan.pdf](http://mediacenter.kpu.go.id/images/mediacenter/DATA_OLAHAN/juli/statistik_dpr_09-14-tingkat_pendidikan.pdf) (being accessed 15/03/2014)
- Street, John (2005). *Politics & Popular Culture*. Cambridge: Polity Press
- Terius, Ms. 'Daftar "Dinasti Keluarga" dalam Partai Peserta Pemilu', dalam Ciri Cara. com., 05/08/2013 (being accessed 05/03/2014)
- The India Site*, Sunday, 19 May 2013 (being accessed 02/03/2014)
- Ware, Alan (1999). *Political Parties and Party Systems*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, Wheeler, Mark (2013). *Celebrity Politics*. Cambridge: Polity Press. in [www.indosiar.com/ragam/kuota-30-persen-perempuan-dalam-politik\\_75-18.html](http://www.indosiar.com/ragam/kuota-30-persen-perempuan-dalam-politik_75-18.html). (being accessed 28/02/2014)



## Endnotes

- 1 Read Alan War (1999). *Political Parties and Party Systems*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 2 The end of the Cold War, the emergence of globalization, the spread of democracy, and the development of communication and information technology were some factors that attenuated ideology in politics and in political party system.
- 3 Alan Ware. *Op.cit.*, pp.225-226
- 4 *Ibid.*, pp.226-227
- 5 In democratic society, political party was a political institution bridging the government and its citizens. One of many roles and functions, which should be employed and became the center of attention of the electorates was nominating and representing the candidates in the election. Ideally, out of the recruited and trained cadres, the political party would select and choose the legislative candidates for the Election.
- 6 *Ibid.*, pp.76-77.
- 7 *Ibid.*, pp.227.
- 8 *Ibid.* According to Julie Ballington and Ricahard Matland in their article entitled *Political Parties and Special Measures: Enhancing Women's Participation in Electoral Process* (2004) in post-conflict election where there were no organized political party system, elitists domination, patron-client legislative candidate recruitment, hierarchical and political party leader or faction domination, patriarchal climate, ethnic... regional, religious, racial or language-based bond and loyalty would emerged. Political party was the reflection of the society where it existed. This phenomenon was emphasized by both authors on a quote: "The party system is clearly a reflection of the society from which it has come; in it the politicians reproduce the styles and conduct of society."
- 9 Percentage of women in legislative institutions (People's Representative Council or DPR) in elections in New Order regime was as follow: 13.0% (1987), 12.5% (1992), and 10.8% (1997). Through more democratic election in 1999, female representation only reached 9%. The awareness of lack of female representation in democratic election result encouraged the activists and female politicians to fight for the policy of 30% quota for women in Election Law of 2004.
- 10 *Kebijakan Peningkatan Keterwakilan Perempuan Pemilu 2004 dan 2009*, from an article published by Puskapol in [www.puskapol.ui.ac.id/artikel/kebijakan-peningkatan-keterwakilan-perempuan-pemilu-2004-dan-2009.html](http://www.puskapol.ui.ac.id/artikel/kebijakan-peningkatan-keterwakilan-perempuan-pemilu-2004-dan-2009.html), accessed on 16 March 2014.
- 11 The complaints from several small political parties drove KPU of making some changes in their policy by allowing parties, which were unable to fulfill the quota in Provincial and Regional level, by attaching a letter of explanation to the public containing the reason why they could not fulfill 30% quota of female representation. [www.indopos.co. id/2012/09/ keterwakilan-perempuan-di-politik-jangan-basa-basi.html](http://www.indopos.co.id/2012/09/keterwakilan-perempuan-di-politik-jangan-basa-basi.html). (accessed on 16 March 2014).
- 12 Term commonly used by legislative candidate who functioned to attract as many voters as possible to choose the political party that nominated the candidate was vote getter (or *pendulang suara*, in Indonesia).

- 13 Formappi, *forum masyarakat peduli parlemen Indonesia* is a CSO (Civil Society Organization or *Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat*), which highlighted the parliamentary performance in Indonesia. This organization was established in 2001 by some activists from reformation 1998 movement. This paper used some data on legislative candidate in 2014 Election done by this organization.
- 14 Some newspaper often posted photos of sleeping DPR members on on-going meeting. The photos of honorary parliament members gave bad image upon the legislative members. The same image was used to the recruited legislative candidate only to fulfill the determined quota.
- 15 Seven occupation categories were grouped by Formappi from 36 types of occupations listed in *Daftar Calon Legislatif* (DCT) based on the legal document in General Election Commission (KPU).
- 16 The percentage of occupational categorization was obtained from the calculation done by Formappi, made based on the legal document on fixed legislative candidate issued by KPU.
- 17 Forty-one percent of female legislative candidate in 2014 Election who came from business world or private enterprises was considered a great number if compared to the total members of Lok Sabha (parliament) in India, which only had 6.4% from business group. The data was taken from *The India Site*, Sunday, 19 May 2013.
- 18 John Street (2003), *The Celebrity Politician: Political Style and Popular Culture*, in J Corner and J Pels (eds) *The Media and the Restyling of Politics*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: Sage Publication, in Mark Wheeler (2013), *Celebrity Politics*, Polity Press, p.13.
- 19 John Street (2004), *Celebrity Politicians: Popular Culture and Political Representation*. *The British Journal of Politics and International Relations* 6(4): 447, in Wheeler, *ibid*.
- 20 Wheeler, *ibid*.
- 21 Nine political parties, which had celebrity legislative candidates, were: PAN and Gerindra, each had nine persons; PKB had seven persons; Nasdem had six; Partai Demokrat and PDIP, each had five; PPP had three; Golkar and Hanura each had three. Three political parties, which had no celebrity legislative candidates, were PKS, PBB, and PKPI.
- 22 *Contagion* theory was developed by Richard Matland and Studlar. According to them, female representation would be more effective in PR system. They explained that as big political parties increased, there would be a bigger chance for one of the parties to promote female candidate. From the studies they did in Scandinavian countries, they found that commonly, small ideology-oriented political parties began to do so. This theory was commonly used to explain the increasing number of female representation and it also received many criticisms and revision. Read Mona Krook et.al *The Impact of Gender Quota: A Research Agenda*, this paper is presented in The First European Conference on Politics and Gender, in Queen's University, Belfast, Northern Island, January 21-23, 2009; Read also Meryl Kenny & Tania Verge, *Contagion Theory Revisited: When do political parties compete on women's representation?*, this paper will be presented in Congreso AECPA, in Sevilla GT 2.8 Genero y politica en tiempos de cambio, 18-20 September 2013.

- 23 In the first phase, a person decided to enter the election for political position. Besides ambition, resources and opportunities was decisive for the decision. The second phase was where the political party did candidate selection for another crucial step. In bureaucratic election system, the rules on election would decision the result. In patronage-oriented political party, the rules for election were blurry, although the existed rules sometimes were ignored because the party chairman would decide everything. The last phase was election by the constitutions. Various election system determined the percentage of women's opportunity of becoming legislative members. Proportional system with closed list gave higher possibility for women to be chosen. Richard Marland and K. Montgomery (2003) 'Recruiting Women to National Lagislature', p.21. in Julie Ballington & Richard Matland (2004) *Political Parties and Special Measures: Enhancing Women's Participation in Electoral Processes*, p.3
- 24 J.L. Hylland (1995), *Democratic Theory*, Manchester University Press, p. 95. In Michael Saward (1998) , *The Terms of Democracy*, Polity Press, hal.57-58; baca juga Alan ware. Op.cit., pp. 111-112.
- 25 Ms. Terius, 'Daftar "Dinasti Keluarga" dalam Partai Peserta Pemilu', Ciri Cara.com., 05/08/2013. The data included in the news could be a small excerpt of legislative candidate from dynasty/family phenomena. Further data collection was needed regarding this phenomenon to acquire more actual and accurate data. And those who were included in the data were still going through the election process to become legislative members.
- 26 See the data released by *The India Site*, Sunday, 19 May 2013.
- 27 Cindy Herlin Mara, Research Institution of Prapanca Research analysis in the news entitled "Citra Politisi Perempuan Indonesia Cenderung Buruk" in *Tribunenews.com*, 28 July 2013 (17.10 WIB).
- 28 *Ibid*.
- 29 [www.indosiar.com/ragam/kuota-30-persen-perempuan-dalam-politik\\_75-18.html](http://www.indosiar.com/ragam/kuota-30-persen-perempuan-dalam-politik_75-18.html). Accessed 28 February 2014 on 22.10.
- 30 Read Leya Cattleya, Review: The Asia's Foundation's "Increasing Women's Political Participation and Strengthening Good Governance in Indonesia" Program Funded by the Royal Norwegian Embassy, Jakarta. Final Report. 2010. TAF's Program of Increasing Women Political Participation.
- 31 2009-2014 DPR Member Statistics, Election Result based on Educational Level. Accessed from [mediacenter.kpu.go.id/images/mediacenter/DATA\\_OLAHAN/juli/statistik\\_dpr\\_09-14-tingkat\\_pendidikan.pdf](http://mediacenter.kpu.go.id/images/mediacenter/DATA_OLAHAN/juli/statistik_dpr_09-14-tingkat_pendidikan.pdf)
- 32 Andrea Fleschenberg, who studied the raise of Asian female politicians in their highest position, explained that many of them raised in the highest top of politics was when the country was in turmoil, transition opened an opportunity for them and they were deemed as changing agent in political agenda to change the existed political regime. They were clasified as 'transformational leader' in the start of their career. When they finally reached formal positions as Prime Minister of President, most of them changed into 'transactional leader.' See Andrea Fleschenberg, "Asia's Women Politicians at the Top: Roaring Tigresses or Time Kittens?" in Iwanaga, chapter 2, p. 12; accessed from Iwanaga-2\_extract.pdf

- 33 See UNDP Report (2010) on women's participation in politics and governance. Accessed from [partpol\\_womenparticipationpoliticsgovernmentindonesia\\_undp\\_may2010.pdf](#)
- 34 Michael Saward (2010), *Remainders and Opportunities: recent theories of political representation* in *The Representative Claim*. Oxford, Oxford University Press. pp.15-16 in Nuri Soeseno, *Representasi Politik: Perkembangan dari Ajektive ke Teori*. pp.36.
- 35 Nuri Soeseno, *ibid.* pp.33-35.
- 36 *Ibid.* pp.36-38.
- 37 Among them were the data on: educational level where 75% were university graduates, 58% lived outside their election area, 69.7% were not political party cadres, and were not in important position in their political party organizational structure.
- 38 Beth Reingold (2006) "*Women as Office Holder: Linking Descriptive and Substantive Representation*" paper prepared for presentation at the conference on "Political Women and American Democracy" at University of Notre Dame, May 25-27, 2006. Hlm. 5-10.
- 39 Read Karen Celis and Sarah Childs's study on "Introduction: The Descriptive and Substantive Representation of Women: New Direction" in *Parliamentary Affairs* Vol.61, Issue 3, pp.419-425.
- 40 Richard Matland considered female representation in political institutions was symbolic. Quota system was meaningless because women did not really acquire the opportunity to give political advices. Richard Matland, *Women, Quota and Politics*. pp. 278-282.
- 41 Sarah Childs and Mona Lena Krook. (2009) "Analysing Women's Substantive Representation: From Critical Mass to Critical Actors" in *Government and Opposition*, Vol.44, No.2, hlm.125-145, 2009. pp 126-128. [mlkrook.org/pdf/childs\\_krook\\_2009.pdf](#) (diakses 29/03/2014).
- 42 *Ibid.* pp.126-127.
- 43 *Ibid.*, pp.127; In the concept of "critical actors," Childs and Krook emphasized the role of each individual, as someone who had the skill and capacity to make a decision and changing agent, both by himself or with others in a group.
- 44 *Ibid.*, pp.138.
- 45 *Ibid.*, pp.144-145.
- 46 Beth Reingold, *Loc.cit.*, hlm. 10-13